

**MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)  
Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Consultant**

**FIELD VISIT REPORT**

---

1. Period of Visit : 05 February – 06 February 2018
2. Location of Visit : MDSP Sites under Chittagong District.
3. Package No. : Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/CHI/W-01
4. Name of Contractor : M/S M.A.H. Construction Ltd. & Munir Ahmed JV
5. Participant of visit : A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman, TL, M&E Consultant,  
Md. Matiur Rahman, Civil Engineer/ M&E Specialist, M&E Consultant,  
Dr. Md. Barkat Ullah, Environment Specialist, M&E Consultant,
6. Officials met during Visit :

**LGED OFFICIALS**

- Mr. Md. Shah Alamgir, Executive Engineer, LGED, Chittagong
- Mr. Shah Alam, Upazila Engineer, LGED, Fatikchhari UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Md. Jahirul Islam, Sub-Assistant Engineer, LGED, Fatikchhari UZ, Chittagong

**D&S CONSULTANTS**

- Mr. Shanewaz Mohammad Shusan, Field Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, Chittagong;
- Mr. Rokunuzzaman, Estimator cum Lab Technician, D&S Consultant, Chittagong
- Mr. Abul Fazal Sajib, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, Boalkhali UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Selim Reza, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, Anwara UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Al-Imran Chowdhury, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, Fatikchhari & Hathazari UZs, Chittagong;

**CONTRACTORS' PERSONNEL**

- Mr. Monsur Ahmed, Chief Executive officer;
- Mr. Mohammad Kaiser, Site Manager; Anwara UZ;
- Mr. Sirazul Islam Rashed, Site Manager, Boalkhali UZ;
- Mr. Atiqur Rahman, Site Engineer; Boalkhali UZ, (Hired from another project under execution by the Contractor).

**SMCs**

- Mrs. Supriya Dey. Head Mistress, Uttar Sakpura GPS at Boalkhali UZ
- Mr. Tuntu Sarma, Head Master, 28 No. Sakpura Sultania GPS at Boalkhali UZ
- Mr. Sujoy Pal, Head Master, 7 No. East Bairag GPS at Anwara UZ
- Mrs. Gita Prova Dutta, Head Mistress, Barakhain Padma Para GPS at Anwara UZ

- Mrs. Sanjida Begum, Head Mistress, 33 No. Barumchara Samudia GPS at Anwara UZ
- Mr. Abdul Latif Talukder, Head Master, Companitala GPS at Fatikchhari UZ
- Mr. Mohammad Afser Uddin, Donner SMC Member, Companitala GPS at Fatikchhari UZ
- Mr. Abdul Gani Chowdhury, SMC Member, Companitala GPS at Fatikchhari UZ
- Mr. Mohammad Rezwan, Head Master, Gasbaria GPS at Fatikchhari UZ
- Mr. Nur-us Safa, Head Master, Roshongiri Arbania GPS at Fatikchhari UZ
- Mr. Ahmed Hossain, Vice-President, SMC, Roshongiri Arbania GPS at Fatikchhari UZ
- Mr. Faridul Alam, Head Master, Uttar Nichintapur GPS at Fatikchhari UZ

7. Activities of Visit : **Monitoring of the Implementation Activities of MDSP**

8. Sites visited :

The following Shelters sites were visited: -

Package no. LGED/MDSP/CHI/W-01:

- i) CTGE-187: Uttar Sakpura GPS cum CS at Boalkhali UZ;
- ii) CTGE-189: 28 No. Sakpura Sultania GPS cum CS at Boalkhali UZ;
- iii) CTGE-02: 7 No. East Bairag GPS cum CS at Anwara UZ;
- iv) CTGE-11: Barakhain Padma Para GPS cum CS at Anwara UZ;
- v) CTGE-37: 33 No. Barumchara Samudia GPS cum CS at Anwara UZ;
- vi) CTGE-711: Companitala GPS cum CS at Fatikchhari UZ;
- vii) CTGE-204: Gasbaria GPS cum CS at Fatikchhari UZ;
- viii) CTGE-216: Roshongiri Arbania GPS cum CS at Fatikchhari UZ;
- ix) CTGE-215: Uttar Nichintapur GPS cum CS at Fatikchhari UZ;
- x) CTGE-229: 5 No. Forhadabad GPS cum CS at Hathazari UZ

## 9. Findings and Observations of M&E Consultants:

### A. General:

The M&E Consultants undertake the field visits as part of its obligation to perform the following:

- a) Overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation activities;
- b) Carry out independent monitoring of project progress, inputs, outputs and outcomes and impact of project interventions at different point time;
- c) Supervise compliance of social and environmental safeguards;
- d) Propose recommendations for appropriate corrective actions, if any.

## B. Physical works:

The M&E Consultants visited the following shelter sites under rehabilitation:

### Rehabilitation of Existing Shelters

The M&E team visited 10 nos. existing shelter sites in Boalkhali, Anwara, Fatikchhari and Hathazari upazilas of Chittagong district.

LGED/MDSP/CHI/W-01 is an ICB contract package in Chittagong consisting of rehabilitation of 130 nos. existing shelters. Major physical shelter rehabilitation works include: roof top screeding, lean concreting & patent stone casting, outside and inside plastering works, outside and inside painting works, school furniture supply, construction/ re-construction of boundary walls as and where necessary, repair of staircases, supplying and fixing of ventilator grills and veranda grills, installation of M.S. Grill Swing Gate as necessary, construction/ cleaning of septic tanks, repair of toilets, electrification works and back filling works etc. as required.

### Field visit observations:

- **Construction Schedule:** No construction schedule of the contract package as also of individual shelter were available at sites. This is an essential instrument to program and monitor the construction activities. Overall Package Construction Schedule along with site specific construction schedule showing the dates of actual implementation of the various work elements against targets should be prepared and monitored by the responsible persons. If necessary, the schedules may be periodically updated.  
The contract provides completion of the rehabilitation works of 130 shelters within a period of 18 months. The contractor's personnel try to give the impression that they will complete works by the total completion period of 18 months. This idea is faulty. In reality, the construction schedule should be prepared targeting completion of works in phases, for example 30 shelters in first phase- 6 months; 50 shelters in second phase-6 months; and 50 shelters in third phase- 6 months. This is particularly important to give early benefit and avoid hazards in schooling activities due to construction works.
- **Site Plan:** No site plan showing the existing structure, demarcated storage yard of construction materials, waste disposal sites, labour sheds etc. was available at any working site. Site Plan is an essential element in respect of planned and systematic implementation of works meeting environmental as well as social safeguard concerns at construction phase.
- **BOQ items:** Site specific BOQ item wise estimates were found only at sites in Anwara & Fatikchhari UZs.
- **Contractor's Technical Personnel:** We were informed that there is provision of 4 nos. graduate civil engineers and 16 nos. diploma engineers to be deployed by the contractor for supervision works. No technical person of the contractor was available at any shelter site on the first day of our visit in Boalkhali and Anwara UZ. On the second day of visit at Fatikchhari & Hathazari UZs, one diploma engineer engaged by the same contractor for supervision of another LGED project was brought in. Contractor's representative stated that he looks after works of two LGED projects.
- **Material Test:** No material test report was available during the visit. It is learnt that no test of materials has been conducted till date.

**Rehabilitation Need Assessment:** Assessment of the rehabilitation needs of the shelters should have been more exhaustive targeting overall and sustained stability of the infrastructures instead of doing some patch repair works (**Photo: 1**). In CTGE- 216, one beam on the ground floor was seen to be done by the contractor at his own initiative as it is not included in the BoQ. There is no drop wall to support the filled earth of the ground floor located close to a pond. The earthen ground floor need to be pucca. (**Photo: 2**).



- **Supply of furniture:** High and low benches for use of the students have been supplied in some of the schools (**Photo: 3**). The high benches do not have separate shelf for keeping school bags. High benches with separate shelves may be supplied (**Photo: 4**).



- **D&S Consultant's role in field supervision:**  
 The D&S Consultant acts as 'Engineer' of the project. Mr.A.K.M.Rafiqul Islam, RRE, Chittagong looks after works of Chittagong and Cox's bazar districts; there is only one FRE and four field supervisors for each of the districts.  
 In Chittagong, the works are widely spread out in different distantly located UZs of the district. It is indeed very difficult on the part of limited field staff to supervise works. From our field visit perception, we found Mr. Shanewaz Mohammad Shusan, FRE, Chittagong as knowledgeable and hard working. He moves around with a motor bike trying his best to achieve quality works but in absence of the technical supervisory personnel of the contractor, it is very difficult on the part of the limited D&S field staff to communicate views and ensure quality works. There is no qualified person of the contractor to receive advice on technical, environmental and social safety issues and implement those. The combined and consolidated effort of the D&S consultant field personnel, contractor's assigned technical staff and support from the LGED field personnel is essential for quality control of works meeting environmental and social safeguard requirements. The RRE may exert more by taking extensive field visits.

## Shelter wise progress status:

Our observations on the rehabilitation item of works in the visited shelter sites are as follows:

- **Roof Top Screeding:** This item of work has been completed in CTGE-187, CTGE-189, CTGE-02, CTGE-11), CTGE-37, CTGE-711 CTGE-204 and CTGE-216 (**Photo: 5**). This work was necessary stop leakage of water through the dilapidated roof slab.



- **Lean Concreting & Patent Stone Casting:** This item of works have been completed at ground floor/ 1<sup>st</sup> floors and staircases as necessary in CTGE-187, CTGE-189, CTGE-37, CTGE-711 & CTGE-204 (**Photo :6**). Works are still ongoing in CTGE-02 & CTGE-11.



- **Brick Work and Construction/ Re-construction of Boundary Walls:** Brick work at ground floor is included in CTGE-187 & construction of boundary wall in CTGE-189 (**Photo :7**). Both works have been completed.





- **Outside and Inside Plastering Works:** Petty plastering works on the walls at ground floor/ 1<sup>st</sup> floors and staircases as necessary have been done in CTGE-711. Same works are still ongoing in CTGE-187 CTGE-189, CTGE-02, CTGE-11, CTGE-37, CTGE-204, CTGE-216 & CTGE-215 (**Photo: 8**).



- **Outside and Inside Painting Works:** Outside and Inside Painting Works are included in all shelter sites. Works are on-going only in CTGE-02. It was seen that painting works in CTGE-711 is nearing completion. (**Photo: 9**). It was informed that Berger plastic paint will be used in all shelters.



- **Construction/ Cleaning of Septic Tank:** Septic Tank construction was seen to be done in CTGE-189 (**Photo :10**). Cleaning of Septic Tank has been completed in CTGE-02 but yet to start in CTGE-11 & CTGE-37.



- **Re-construction of Toilet:** Reconstruction of toilet in CTGE-189 has been completed. Door fixing in toilet in CTGE-37 not yet started.

- **Supplying and Fixing of Ventilator Grills and Veranda Grills/ Railing, Installation of M.S. Grill Swing Gate etc:** This item of work is ongoing in CTGE-187, CTGE-189, CTGE-711, CTGE-204 and CTGE-216 (**Photo :11**)



- **Electrification Works:** Patch electrical repair works are ongoing in CTGE-187, CTGE-189, CTGE-02, CTGE-11 & CTGE-37 (**Photo: 12**).



- **Furniture Supply:** Supply of school furniture (Steel Almirah, File cabinet, high and low benches etc.) is included in the BoQ. High and low benches (Tanin Brand) have been supplied in many shelters.

The Physical progress of the 10 nos. of shelter sites are as follows: **CTGE-187: 55%; CTGE-189: 60%; CTGE-02: 40%; CTGE-11: 40%; CTGE-37: 30%; CTGE-711: 60%; CTGE-204: 35%; CTGE-216: 30%; CTGE-215: 5%, and CTGE-229:0%** (Physical works not yet started).

### **C. Environmental Safety Measures**

The project will ensure that environmental safety considerations are given sufficient attention into project design of cyclone shelters. To this end, Environmental Assessment (EA) for all rehabilitation of existing cyclone shelters under the package have been carried out by the D&S consultants and concurred by the WB. The EA has chalked out specific EMP measures to address the environmental safety aspect. 8(eight) nos. environmental safety measures have been suggested for the package involving rehabilitation of 130 nos. shelters.

These are: a) First aid box; b) Dust suppression measures; c) Working labour shed; d) Project sign board; e) Safety gear package; f) Temporary sanitary latrine; g) water filter and h) site cleaning.

Provision of an amount of Tk.61,70,356.00 has been made in the contract for the purpose.

## **Compliance of Environmental Safety Measures.**

Our observations during the field visit on the general compliance of the EMPs are as follows:

### **a) First Aid Box**

First aid boxes were found at sites of CTGE-187, CTGE-189, CTGE-02, CTGE-11, CTGE-711, CTGE-204 and CTGE-216 (**Photo 00723**). At some sites, the boxes did not contain all contents. No first aid box was seen at CTGE-37 and CTGE-215 sites.

### **b) Dust Suppression Measures**

Sand stored in most of the visited sites was not covered except at CTGE-711, CTGE-204 and CTGE-216. In CTGE-189, the sacks of cements were kept on the school corridor instead of material store (**Photo:13**).



### **c) Labor Shed**

Though there is provision of constructing one no. labor shed per three nos. of shelter sites, no working labor shed was found at any site. It was informed that labor sheds have been hired but these could not be shown.

### **d) Posting of Signboard**

Display sign boards were found in all the shelter sites except at CTGE-11 and CTGE-37. GRC display board was missing.

### **e) Safety Gear Package**

Safety gear materials (hand gloves, helmets, eye protection glasses, rubber shoes light reflecting dresses, etc.) were found in most of the visited shelter sites, but no safety gear packages were found in CTGE-11, CTGE-37 and CTGE-215. It is also important to motivate all the labours to use safety gears. (**Photo:14**).



### **f) Temporary Sanitary Latrine**

Sanitary latrines ought to be constructed alongside the labour sheds. No temporary sanitary latrine was seen at any shelter site.



### **g) Water Filter**

Functional water filters were found in each shelter site except CTGE-37 and CTGE-215 (**Photo:15**).



### **h) Site Cleaning**

This item is meant to keep the site clean during and after construction. Effective measures should be taken to keep the site clean during construction phase particularly with the perspective of facilitating hazardless schooling activities.

### **D. Compliance of SMP**

The rehabilitation of the shelters will be done in the existing government school buildings. The rehabilitation works of existing shelters do not require land acquisition and resettlement of the PAPs. During field visit, no problem relating to land and resettlement of PAPs was observed.

### **E. Opinion of SMC**

The Head Master/Head Mistress are important members of the SMC. During visits, some of them informed that due to rehabilitation of the existing school buildings, congenial scenario for imparting proper education would be created. This along with supply of school logistics will greatly create a good environment for an improved schooling activities. They verily hope that after completion of works, the nos. of student enrolment will increase.

They however emphasized the need of quick completion of works as obviously the construction works create some sort of hindrance in the performance of school works.

### **F. Conclusion.**

We would recommend to PMU, D&S consultants and related stakeholders to please consider our observations given above and take necessary measures as deemed appropriate.

Finally, we express our deep gratitude to Mr. Md. Shah Alamgir, Executive Engineer, Chittagong to have very fruitful exchange of views in respect of implementation of rehabilitation works with particular emphasis on environmental and social safeguard aspect. We also express our appreciation and thanks to the field personnel of LGED, the DS Consultants, School Authorities, Teachers and the Contractor for their kind cooperation extended to us during the field visit.

**A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,**  
**Team Leader, M&E Consultants,**  
**MDSP, LGED**