

**MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)  
Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Consultant**

**FIELD VISIT REPORT**

---

1. Period of Visit : 04 November– 05 November 2018
2. Location of Visit : MDSP Rehabilitation Shelter Sites under Chittagong District.
3. Package No. : Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/CHI/W-01
4. Name of Contractor : M/S M.A.H. Construction Ltd. & Munir Ahmed JV
5. Participant of visit : A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman, TL, M&E Consultant,  
Md. Matiur Rahman, Civil Engineer/ M&E Specialist, M&E Consultant,

6. Officials met during Visit :

**LGED OFFICIALS**

- Mr. Md. Jahangir Alam, Upazila Engineer, LGED, Sitakunda UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Md. Abdul Hannan, Sub-Assistant Engineer, LGED, Sitakunda UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Anupam Sikder, Sub-Assistant Engineer, LGED, Anowara UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Md. Mizanur Rahman, Sub-Assistant Engineer, LGED, Mirsharai UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Md. Mustafizur Rahman, Sub-Assistant Engineer, LGED, Mirsharai UZ, Chittagong

**D&S CONSULTANTS**

- Mr. A.K.M. Rafiqul Islam, Regional Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, MDSP, Chittagong;
- Mr. Shanewaz Mohammad Shusan, Field Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, MDSP, Chittagong;
- Mr. Rokunuzzaman, Lab Technician, D&S Consultant, MDSP, Chittagong
- Mr. Touhiduzzaman, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, MDSP, Banskhali UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Selim Reza, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, MDSP, Anwara UZ, Chittagong
- Mr. Md. Rajiv Hossain, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, MDSP, Sitakunda UZ, Chittagong;

## CONTRACTORS' PERSONNEL

- Mr. Mohammad Ali, Contactor's Partner/ Representative;
- Mr. Mohammad Kaiser, Site Manager;
- Mr. Khorshed Alam, Contactor's Partner/ Representative
- Mr. Abdul Alim, Site Manager, Banshkhali UZ;
- Mr. Imranul Hoque, Site Engineer; Anowara & Banshkhali UZs (Hired from another project under implementation by the Contractor);
- Mr. Ershad Ullah (Bablu), Contactor's Partner/ Representative

## SMCs

- Mrs. Sanjida Begum, Head Mistress, 33 No. Barumchara Samudia GPS at Anwara UZ;
- Mrs. Gita Prova Dutta, Head Mistress, Barakhain Padma Para GPS at Anwara UZ;
- Mr. Mohammad Mohiuddin, Head Master, Daskhin Premasiya GPS at Banshkhali UZ;
- Mrs. Zinat Mahal, Head Mistress, 27 No. Paschim Raichita GPS at Banshkhali UZ;
- Mrs. Rasheda Begum, Head Mistress, 19 No. Uttar Raichita GPS at Banshkhali UZ;
- Mr. Sadhan Chandra Das, Head Master, 20 No. Purbo Raichita GPS at Banshkhali UZ;
- Mrs. Sahela Khatun, Head Mistress, Uttar-Pashim Sayedpur GPS at Sitakunda UZ;
- Mr. Sibul Prasad Saha, Head Master, Jamal Michir GPS at Sitakunda UZ;
- Mrs. Nasima Akter, Head Mistress, Sarkerhat GPS at Mirsharai UZ;
- Md. Abdul Ahad, Asstt. Teacher, 127 No. Kuruya GPS at Mirsharai UZ;
- Mr. Mohammad Musa, Secretary, Mithanala UP at Mirsharai UZ;

7. Activities of Visit : **Monitoring of the Implementation Activities of MDSP**

8. Sites visited :

The following rehabilitation shelter sites were visited: -

### **Package no. LGED/MDSP/CHI/W-01:**

- i) CTGE-37 : 33 No. Barumchara Samudia GPS cum CS at Anwara UZ;
- ii) CTGE-11 : Barakhain Padma Para GPS cum CS at Anwara UZ;
- iii) CTGE-154 : Daskhin Premasiya GPS at Banshkhali UZ;
- iv) CTGE-156 : 27 No. Paschim Raichita GPS at Banshkhali UZ;
- v) CTGE-159 : 19 No. Uttar Raichita GPS at Banshkhali UZ;

- vi) CTGE-160 : 20 No. Purbo Raichita GPS at Banshkhali
- vii) CTGE- 669 : Uttar-Pashim Sayedpur GPS at Sitakunda UZ;
- viii) CTGE- 670 : Jamal Misir GPS at Sitakunda UZ;
- ix) CTGE- 717 : Sarkerhat GPS at Mirsharai UZ;
- x) CTGE- 270 : 127 No. Kuruya GPS at Mirsharai UZ;
- xi) CTGE- 307 : Mithanala UP Office at Mirsharai UZ ;

## 9. Findings and Observations of M&E Consultants:

### A. General:

The M&E Consultants undertake the field visits as part of its obligation to perform the following:

- a) Overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation activities;
- b) Carry out independent monitoring of project progress, inputs, outputs and outcomes and impact of project interventions at different point time;
- c) Supervise compliance of social and environmental safeguards;
- d) Propose recommendations for appropriate corrective actions, if any.

### B. Physical works:

The M&E Consultants visited the following rehabilitation shelter sites:

#### Rehabilitation of Existing School cum Shelters

The M&E team visited 11 nos. existing school cum shelter sites in Anowara, Banshkhali, Sitakunda and Mirsharai upazilas of Chittagong district.

**Rehabilitation of Contract Package: LGED/MDSP/CHI/W-01** is an ICB contract package in Chittagong consisting of rehabilitation of **130** nos. existing shelters. Major physical shelter rehabilitation works include: roof top screeding, lean concreting & patent stone casting, outside and inside plastering works as and where necessary, outside and inside painting works, school furniture supply, construction/ re-construction of boundary walls as and where necessary, repair of staircases, supplying and fixing of grills/ railings at ground floor/ staircase and veranda as and where necessary, installation of M.S. Collapsible Gate as necessary, supplying and fixing of door and window shutters/ frames as and where necessary, construction/ cleaning of septic tanks, construction/ re-construction of toilets, electrification works, tiles works and back filling works etc. as required.

#### Field visit observations:

- **Contractor's performance in project implementation:**

The joint venture of M/S M.A.H. Construction Ltd. & Munir Ahmed has been awarded the job of the contract package scattered over 13 Upazillas of Chattogram district. It is learnt that the lead contractor M/S M.A.H. Construction Ltd. is never seen in the implementation management of the contract; the other firm of Munir Ahmad takes care of the job. He has again divided the job into two parts: supplying of the furniture and other articles keeping with the firm and physical rehabilitation works being given to several sub-contractors.

- **Contractor's Technical Personnel:** We were informed that there is provision of 4 nos. graduate civil engineers and 16 nos. diploma engineers to be deployed by the contractor for supervision

works. The nos. of qualified persons engaged by the contractor to receive advice on technical, environmental and social safety issues and implement them accordingly are too inadequate. Due to the absence of the required nos. of technical supervisory personnel of the contractor, it is very difficult on the part of the D&S Consultant's field staffs to communicate views, accelerate progress and ensure quality works.

- **Construction Schedule:** No construction schedule of the contract package as also of individual shelter was available at site. This is an essential instrument to program and monitor the construction activities. Overall Package Construction Schedule along with site specific construction schedule showing the dates of actual implementation of the various work elements against targets should be prepared and monitored by the responsible persons. If necessary, the schedules may be periodically updated.

The construction schedule should have been prepared targeting completion of works in phases. This is particularly important to give early benefit and avoid hazards in schooling activities due to construction works.

- **BOQ itemized schedule:** Site specific BOQ item wise estimates were found in all sites.
- **Rehabilitation of Jamal Misir GPS (CTGE-670):** The rehabilitation works include 2 nos. of buildings: one 2-storied and the other one storied damaged building. Works in the 2 storeyed building originally constructed by Caritas (**Photo: 01**) has been taken up but works in the other one storey building has not been taken up as it has been rightly declared abandoned (**Photo: 02**). Because of the abandonment, accommodation of students has become difficult.



The Head Master of the school requested to construct a semi-pucca structure utilizing the balance amount for use as class rooms. The matter may please be considered sympathetically.

- **Rehabilitation Need Assessment:** Assessment of the rehabilitation needs of the shelters should have been more exhaustive targeting overall and sustained stability of the infrastructures instead of doing some patch repair works. (**Photo: 03**).



- **Progress Status**

The contractor has to complete rehabilitation works of **130** shelters within a period of 18 months. Per contract, the target date of completion is **30 November 2018**. It can be noted that as of 31 October 2018, the Contractor has commenced works only in **43 out of 130** nos. existing shelters. Rehabilitation works in **87** nos. school cum shelters are yet untouched. The Contractor's performance in implementation of the rehabilitation works of 130 shelters in Chittagong district is highly disappointing.

Physical progress in 43 shelters out of total 130 has been reported to vary as follows:

5% to 20%: 6 shelters

21% to 60%: 17 shelters

61% to 90%: 20 shelters

We visited 11 nos. shelter sites. The progress status is highlighted below:

- Works ongoing at 5 shelter sites: **CTGE-11: 40%, CTGE-154: 75%, CTGE-156: 75%, CTGE-717: 40% & CTGE-307: 55 %.**
- No physical activity at 4 shelter sites: **CTGE-37: 80%, CTGE-160: 75%, CTGE-669: 75% & CTGE-670: 75%**
- Physical works untouched in 2 shelter sites: **CTGE-159: 0% (Photo: 04) & CTGE-270: 0% (Photo: 05).**



We are of the opinion that the contractor will not be able to complete the works as per contract. D&S Consultant (Engineer) supported by the PMU, LGED should take necessary penal actions against the contractor for poor performance and failure to complete the works in time.

**Item wise Progress Status:**

Our observations on the rehabilitation item of works in the visited shelter sites are as follows:

- **Roof Top Screeding:** This item of work has been completed in CTGE-11, CTGE-154, CTGE-669, CTGE-670, CTGE-717 and CTGE-307 (**Photo: 06**). This work was necessary stop leakage of water through the dilapidated roof slab.





- **Lean Concreting/ Patent Stone Casting:** This item of work has been completed at ground floor/ 1<sup>st</sup> floors as necessary in CTGE-37, CTGE-154, CTGE-156, CTGE-669 & CTGE-717 (**Photo: 07**). Works are still ongoing in CTGE-307 and not yet started in CTGE-160. The quality of work is fairly good.



- **Brick Work as and where necessary:** Petty brick work at ground floor has been completed in CTGE-37 & CTGE-670 (**Photo: 08**). The same item of work has not yet been done in CTGE-156.



- **Construction/ Reconstruction of Staircase:** This item of work has completed in CTGE-669 & CTGE-670. Works are still ongoing in CTGE-37, CTGE-11, CTGE-154, CTGE-156, CTGE-160 (**Photo: 09**)



- **Outside and Inside Plastering Works:** Petty plastering works on the walls at ground floor/ 1<sup>st</sup> floors and staircases as necessary have been done in CTGE-37, CTGE-154, CTGE-156, CTGE-669, CTGE-670 & CTGE-717 (**Photo: 10**). Same works are still ongoing in CTGE-11, CTGE-160 & CTGE-307.



- **Outside and Inside Painting Works:** Outside and Inside Painting Works are have been done in some shelters (**Photo: 11**). It was informed that Berger plastic paint is being used in all shelter sites.



- **Construction/ Cleaning of Septic Tank:** The item covers new construction as well cleaning of old Septic Tank. New construction of Septic Tank is included in CTGE-154 & CTGE-160. Works have not yet started.

Cleaning of Septic Tanks is yet to start in CTGE-37, CTGE-11, CTGE-156 & CTGE-670.

The existing septic tank of **CTGE-156** serves four toilets including one from the main building. The pit and connecting pipe from the main building is damaged. The pit and the connecting pipe should be repaired (**Photo: 12**).



- **Construction/ Re-construction of Toilet:** This item of works has been completed in CTGE-670 (**Photo: 13**).

Construction/ Re-construction of Toilets are still ongoing in CTGE-154, CTGE-160, CTGE-669 & CTGE-307.

Works have not yet started in CTGE-37, CTGE-11 & CTGE-156.



- **Supplying and Fixing of Grills & Railing at Ground Floor/ Staircase, Ventilator/ Veranda Grills, Installation of M.S. Collapsible Gate etc.:** This item of work has been completed in CTGE-670. Works are still ongoing in CTGE-11, CTGE-154, CTGE-156, CTGE-669 & CTGE-717 (**Photo: 14**) and works have yet to start in CTGE-37 & CTGE-717.



- **Supplying and Fixing of Door and Window Shutters/ Frames as and where necessary:** This item of work is ongoing in CTGE-160, CTGE- 270 & CTGE-307 (**Photo: 15**).



- **Electrification Works:** Electrification works have been completed in CTGE-154 & CTGE-156. Works are still ongoing in CTGE-11, CTGE-669 & CTGE-670 (**Photo: 16**).



- **Installation of Deep Tube-well:** This item of work is only included in CTGE-156, but work has not yet started.
- **Site Improvement:** Site improvement by earth filling is included only in CTGE-37 (**Photo: 17**). Work has not yet started.





- **Furniture Supply:** Supply of school furniture (Teachers Chairs & Tables, Steel Almirah, File Cabinet, High and Low Benches etc.) is included in the BoQ. High and low benches (Tanin Brand) have been supplied in shelters of Anowara and Banskhali UZs (**Photo: 18**). The same item supplied in Sitakunda & Mirsharai UZs is not of any brand mark (**Photo: 19**).



In some schools, high and low benches have been supplied although physical works have not been taken up yet. In such schools, the furniture so supplied are not in proper use for scarcity of space (**Photo: 20**). These will get damaged due to long storage.



Teachers Chairs & Tables, Steel Almirah, File Cabinet etc. have not supplied to the schools as yet.

### C. Environmental Safety Measures

The project will ensure that environmental safety considerations are given sufficient attention into project design of cyclone shelters. To this end, Environmental Assessment (EA) for all packages need to be done. However, EMP measures for the rehabilitation packages has been maintained minimum. The measures observed are only limited to: i) Supply of First Aid box, ii) Supply of Water Filter, iii) Construction/ cleaning of septic tanks (yet to be done).

The contractor has not built any labor/storage shed at any shelter. Instead, the school class rooms have been used to store materials (**Photo: 21**).



#### **D. Compliance of SMP**

The rehabilitation of the shelters will be done in the existing government school buildings. The rehabilitation works of existing shelters do not require land acquisition and resettlement of the PAPs. During field visit, no problem relating to land and resettlement of PAPs was observed.

#### **E. Opinion of SMC**

The Head Master/Head Mistress are important members of the SMC. During visits, some of them informed that due to rehabilitation of the existing school buildings, congenial scenario for imparting proper education would be created. This along with supply of school logistics will greatly create a good environment for an improved schooling activities. They verily hope that after completion of works, the nos. of student enrolment will increase.

They however emphasized the need of quick completion of works as obviously the construction works create some or other sort of hindrance in the performance of school works.

#### **F. Conclusion.**

We would recommend to PMU, D&S consultants and related stakeholders to please consider our observations given above and take necessary measures as deemed appropriate.

Finally, we express our deep appreciation and thanks to the field personnel of LGED, the DS Consultants, School Authorities, Teachers and the Contractor for their kind cooperation extended to us during the field visit.

**A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,**  
**Team Leader, M&E Consultants,**  
**MDSP, LGED**