

**MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)**  
**Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Consultant**

**FIELD VISIT REPORT**

---

1. Period of Visit : 10 September – 11 September 2018
2. Location of Visit : Bhola District.
3. Participant of visit : A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman, TL, M&E Consultant,  
Dr. Md. Barkat Ullah, Environment Specialist, M&E Consultant.
4. Officials met during Visit :

**LGED**

- Mr. Subrata Mojumder, Assistant Engineer, MDSP

**D&S CONSULTANTS**

- Mr. Md. Abdul Hamid Khan, RRE, Barisal Region
- Mr. Md. Rafikul Islam, FRE, Bhola
- Mr. Md. Shah Nawaz, FS, Bhola
- Mr. Md. Abu Baker Siddik, Field Supervisor
- Mr. Syed Habibur Rahman, Field Supervisor

**CONTRACTORS' PERSONNEL- M/S Toma Construction & Co. Ltd**

- Mr. Md. Asaduzzaman Asad, Project Manager
- Mr. Md. Anisur Rahman, Deputy Project Manager
- Mr. Abdur Rahim, Project Engineer
- Mr. Md. Waliur Rahman, Community Coordinator
- Mr. Md. Sabuj, Site Engineer
- Mr. Md. Abu Shufian, Site Engineer
- Mr. AKM Arif, Site Engineer
- Mr. Md. Bellal, Site Engineer
- Mr. Md. Jewel Ahmad, Site Engineer
- Md. Shohidul Islam, Site Engineer
- Mr. Md. Afzal Khan, Site Engineer

5. Activities of Visit : **Monitoring of the Implementation Activities of MDSP**
6. Sites visited: The following Shelter sites were visited: -

**Package no. LGED/MDSP-II-7-LPI-O-NW-02:**

- |   |                 |                                     |
|---|-----------------|-------------------------------------|
| - | <b>BHP-27:</b>  | <b>Advocate Younus Miah GPS</b>     |
| - | <b>BHP-43:</b>  | <b>Dakhin Purbo Kandrakpur GPS</b>  |
| - | <b>BHP-227:</b> | <b>Dakkhin Fakira Co-Aid GPS</b>    |
| - | <b>BHP-302:</b> | <b>Uttar Char Aicha GPS</b>         |
| - | <b>BHP-303:</b> | <b>Uttar Sosivushon GPS</b>         |
| - | <b>BHP-313:</b> | <b>14 No. Purbo Lalgora GPS</b>     |
| - | <b>BHP-317:</b> | <b>Dakkhin Paschim Jaynagar GPS</b> |
| - | <b>BHP-359:</b> | <b>178 No. Balam Char GPS</b>       |
| - | <b>BHP-413:</b> | <b>107 No. Kata Khali GPS</b>       |

7. Findings and Observations of the M&E Consultants:

## **A. General:**

The M&E Consultants undertake the field visits as part of its obligation to perform the following:

- a) Overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation activities;
- b) Carry out independent monitoring of project progress, inputs, outputs and outcomes and impact of project interventions at different point time;
- c) Supervise compliance of social and environmental safeguards;
- d) Propose recommendations for appropriate corrective actions, if any.

## **B. Physical works:**

The M&E Consultants visited the following shelter sites:

### **Construction of New Shelters including Shelter Connecting Road**

The M&E team visited 09 nos. under construction new shelter sites of MDSP in Charfession, Lalmohon, Tojumuddin, Daulatkhan and Sadar Upazilas of Bhola district.

- **Site selection:** The site selections for construction of new shelters have generally been fairly good and appropriate in consideration of the vulnerability of the people in terms of taking shelter during disasters.
- **Staff Mobilization by the Contractor:** M/S. Toma Construction and Company Ltd. has made fair mobilization of field personnel; Project Manager, Deputy Project Manager, Community Organizers, Site Engineers, Material Engineer, Lab Technicians and other support staffs etc. have been mobilized.
- **Construction Schedule:** During our first visit to the contract package sites at Bhola on 22 November, 2017, we were happy to observe a general construction schedule of shelters for the package. The schedule had been prepared in a diagram that shows only the proposed start and completion dates of the various work elements. We advised to prepare site specific construction schedules. During our present visit, we found that site specific construction schedules have been prepared. However, the actual dates of implementation of the various work elements against targets are not shown. As part of monitoring, dates of actual implementation of the various work elements against targets for each individual structure site should be recorded. In case, the schedule could not be followed as planned due to unavoidable reasons, the construction schedules should pragmatically be updated and followed.
- **Site Plan:** Site Plan showing the demarcated storage yard of construction materials, labour sheds, tube wells and toilets for construction labours, re-bar fabrication yard, waste disposal areas etc. has not been made for any working site. A Site Plan is an essential instrument for efficient performance of construction works particularly in respect of ensuring environmental as well as social safeguard measures prior to and during construction activities. In the absence of proper site plan, work is going on haphazardly.
- **Physical Progress:**
  - As of end of August 2018, overall cumulative physical progress of the package is **44.60%** against cumulative target of **72.00%**. It indicates that the progress is considerably lagging behind.
  - The structure wise physical progress of the visited 09 nos. shelter sites are as follows: **BHP-227: 40%; BHP-302: 60%; BHP-317: 64%; BHP-303: 62%, BHP-359: 63%, BHP-413: 63%, BHP-313: 64%, BHP-27: 63% and BHP-43: 33%.**

- The physical works of the different visited shelters mainly include:

- 1) Foundation works up to grade beams;
- 2) Ground floor slab casting;
- 3) 1<sup>st</sup> floor slab casting;
- 4) 2<sup>nd</sup> floor slab casting;
- 5) Ramp construction;
- 6) Brick work etc.

Photo of BHP-303: Uttar Shasibhusan GPS at Charfession is shown in **(Photo: 01)**.



- It has been observed from the D&S Consultant QPR for the month of August that the progress of 06 nos. shelter structures located at Monpura island varies from **24% to 29%** only. Special attention must be given to accelerate progress of structures at the remote island.

Our observations on the works so far done in the above 09 nos. shelter sites are as follows:

- Laboratory tests of MS rod, coarse sand, cement etc. are being done. Test reports of water, coarse aggregate/ fine aggregate have been made available in the field.
- The quality of stone chips are generally good, however at some sites, stone chips with relatively larger size have been found **(Photo: 02)**. Contractor representatives have been advised to use only properly graded stone chips following design requirement.
- Quality steel shutters with steel props have been used in all RCC works **(Photo: 03)**.
- Site offices and labor sheds have been constructed in most of the sites.
- MS rods have generally been properly stacked **(Photo: 04)** however with few exceptions.



- The quality of concrete works should be further improved (**Photo: 05**).



- The quality of brickworks in some shelters appears poor (**Photo 06**). The contractor's representatives informed that good quality bricks are not available in Bhola. The statement is confusing as we have seen machine made bricks at some other sites (**Photo: 07**).



- The quality of plastering works appears fairly good (**Photo: 08**). However, the fine sand being used for plastering works should be of proper FM. The fine sand is likely to contain salinity. To neutralize the salinity, chemical re-agent 'Desalt-S' of Baral Chemical Company Ltd. Is being used. However, we have noticed scattered salt deposition at a few plaster surfaces.
- All grooves on the brick walls for fixing concealed pipes should be done before plastering. In **BHP-359**, plastering on the walls was done earlier and then grooves were made later cutting plastered walls. (**Photo: 09**). The RRE of Barisal expressed dissatisfaction for not following the standard practice.





### School Classroom Writing Board

There is provision in the contract to build fixed masonry classroom blackboards on the classroom walls. In many shelters, masonry classroom blackboards have been built (**Photo: 10**). The masonry blackboards with rough surface are not user friendly. White chalks are generally used for writing purposes on the blackboards. Erasing the writings on the board using chalk duster make the surface of the blackboard white when further writings become indistinct. Again, the chalk produces dust which is inhaled by the teachers and even by the students being circulated by the running fans. This view was expressed by the teachers of **BHP-27**.



Instead of the masonry classroom writing board, we would recommend using 'Mobile Classroom Writing Boards' (**Photo: 11, Chalk board**). The features of this type of writing boards are: environment friendly, impeccable finish, hassle free installation and easy to clean.



### Shelter Connecting Roads

There is provision of construction of 15 nos. Shelter Connecting Roads (SCR) of various lengths under the contract of the package. Out of the 15 nos., construction of **SCR of BHP-43** having a length of 980 m has been partially done. 1<sup>st</sup> layer WBM has been done about 6 months ago (**Photo: 12**).



### **C. Compliance of Environmental Safety Measures.**

There is provision of 14 items related to environmental safety measures in the BoQ (including temporary shed) of the contract. The Contractor has engaged Community Organizers to take care of the environment safeguard aspects. We met two Community Organizers during the field visit.

Our observations on the compliance of the environmental safety measures are as follows:

- **First Aid Box:** 2 nos. first aid boxes with standard contents have been procured in all sites (**Photo: 13**). .

**Photo: 13**



- **Water Filter:** Ceramic water filters have been procured at all construction sites (**Photo: 14**).
- **Site Cleaning:** The site has been cleaned at mobilization stage.
- **Grass Turfs:** It is not due yet.
- **Tree Plantation:** Vegetation and tree plantation will be done in due time.

**Photo: 14**



- **Safety Gear Package:** Safety gear package such as helmets, hand gloves, rubber shoes, light reflecting dresses etc. has been found to be used by many of the workers although some workers are reluctant to use them.. (**Photo: 15**).

**Photo: 15**



- **Protection Fencing:** Protective fencing has been found in all construction sites. The fencing has been made by corrugated iron sheets (**Photo: 16**).

**Photo: 16**





- **Sanitary Latrine for Male and Female:** Sanitary latrines for use of the male and female labors have been constructed in most of the sites but the condition of the latrines is not hygienic (**Photo: 17**).

**Photo: 17**



- **Camp Site Waste Disposal Facility:** No planned practice of waste disposal particularly disposal of construction debris was observed. Under-construction debris and garbage are kept haphazardly (**Photo: 18**). Garbage must be stockpiled and removed to a pre-designated waste disposal area. FREs/ site supervisors should monitor this issue strictly.

**Photo: 18**



- **Dust Suppression Measures:** Sand has been covered by polythene in all constructed sites to protect from dust pollution except fully uncovered in **BHP-43** and partially in **BHP-27, BHP-313, BHP-317 and BHP-359**. This should always be covered as suppressive to protect from air pollution (**Photo: 19**).

**Photo: 19**



- **Environmental and Social/Safeguard Personnel:** Environmental and Social/Safeguard personnel termed as Community Coordinators have been engaged.

- **Health/Safety Warning Sign:** Safety signboards have been found in all sites but these were written in English (**Photo: 20 & 21**). The safety signboards should be written in Bengali for easy understanding of the workers.

**Photo: 20**



**Photo: 21**



- **Tube Well:** Tube wells have been installed at all sites to obtain safe drinking water for the labors and site staff and also for use in construction works. The colour of head of the tube well is red (**Photo: 22**). This is confusing. As a convention, red color in tube wells indicates arsenic presence. The color of the tube wells head should be anything other than red preferably green.



Water test reports indicate quality of three parameters: Arsenic content, Iron content and chloride content. The content of arsenic concentration has been written as < LOQ for all samples instead of giving specific concentration values although the same values for other two parameters (Iron content and chloride content) for each sample have been given. Specific arsenic concentration values for each sample should be recorded.

- **Construction of Temporary Shed for Schooling:** There is provision for construction of temporary sheds (75'x20') for class accommodation where existing school buildings had to be demolished (**Photo:23**).



**Site Specific Environmental Assessment Report:** Site specific environmental assessment reports have been seen at site. The concerned persons should pay proper attention to implement the EMPs.

#### D. Compliance of Social Management Plan

The school cum shelter buildings under contract have been mostly constructed in the existing school premises. So, there has been no need for land acquisition and resulting resettlement of PAPs. However, for the **SCR-43**, some additional land was required on both sides of the existing narrow kutchra road to build the SCR as per design (**Photo: 24**). One Mr. Shelim Howladar of **SCR-43** locality under Bhola Sadar UZ informed that the additional land needed for the road has been wilfully donated by the land owners. About 100 nos. betel nut trees had to be felled to accommodate the SCR. The tree owners themselves cut the trees willingly and took these away.





#### **E. Opinion of SMC**

The Head Master/Head Mistress are important members of the SMC. During the visit, we met the Headmaster and other teachers of some schools. The Head Master of **BHP-27** informed that the Government has recently approved one more class called **pre-primary section** in all primary schools. As such, one additional class room would be needed to accommodate the students of the new pre-primary section. He suggested that a new design of primary school cum shelter may be made to accommodate the pre-primary section. LGED may please consider the suggestion made above, if possible.

#### **F. Conclusion.**

We would recommend to PMU, D&S consultants and related stakeholders to please consider our observations given above and take necessary measures as deemed appropriate.

We express our deep appreciation and thanks to the LGED Engineers, DS Consultants, School Authorities, Teachers and the Contractors for their kind cooperation extended to us during the field visit.

**A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,**  
**Team Leader, M&E Consultants,**  
**MDSP, LGED**