



MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)

(IDA Credit No.5561 BD)

Monitoring and Evaluation Consultancy Services

Local Government Engineering Department (LGED)

To
The Chief Engineer,
LGED, Dhaka.

Date : 20.12.2022
Our ref : MDSP-M&E/FVR/90
Dealt by : Team Leader

Subject : Field Visit Report of the M&E Consultants of MDSP in Chattogram District undertaken on 06-07 December, 2022.

Sir,

I have the pleasure to submit herewith the Field Visit Report of the M&E Consultants on the following Packages of MDSP in Chattogram district:

- i) Construction of New Shelter Package LGED/MDSP/CHI/14-15/NW- 03B
- ii) Construction of New Shelter Package LGED/MDSP/CHI/14-15/NW-10

The M&E Consultant team of MDSP made field visit in Chattogram district on 06-07 December, 2022. This is for favor of your kind disposal.

Regards.

Sincerely yours,

A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,
Team Leader,
M&E Consultants,
MDSP, LGED.
Encl.:- Field Visit Report

- CC:
1. Project Director, MDSP, LGED, Dhaka.
 2. Executive Engineer, LGED, Chattogram district.
 3. Upazilla Engineer, Lohagora UZ, LGED, Lohagora, Chattogram.
 4. Upazilla Engineer, Satkania UZ, LGED, Satkania, Chattogram.
 5. Upazilla Engineer, Sitakunda UZ, LGED, Sitakunda, Chattogram.
 6. Upazilla Engineer, Mirsharai UZ, LGED, Mirsharai, Chattogram
 7. Team Leader, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, Dhaka.
 8. Deputy Team Leader, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, Dhaka.
 9. Regional Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, Chattogram Region.
 10. Field Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, C/O. UZ Engineer, LGED, Mirsharai.
 11. Field Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, Chattogram district
 12. Ignacio Urrutia, TTL, MDSP, WB, Dhaka.
 13. S.M.Zulkernine, Environment Specialist, WB, Dhaka.
 14. Md. Akter Zaman, Social Development Specialist, WB, Dhaka.

**MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)
Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Consultant**

FIELD VISIT REPORT

1. Period of Visit : 06 December – 07 December 2022
2. Location of Visit : MDSP Sites under Chattogram District.
3. Visit of Packages : (i) Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/CHI/14-15/NW-03B
Name of Contractor: M/S Sarker Steel Ltd.

(ii) Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/CHI/14-15/NW-10
Name of Contractor: M/S Wahid Construction Ltd.
4. Participant of visit : A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman, TL, M&E Consultant,
Md. Matiur Rahman, Civil Engineer/ M&E Specialist, M&E
Consultant,
5. Officials met during Visit :

D&S CONSULTANTS

- Mr. Kazi Shahadat Hossain, Regional Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, Chattogram;
- Mr. Md. Rashedur Rahman, Field Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, Feni;
- Mr. Md. Rasel Ahmed, Field Supervisor, Lohagara & Satkania UZs, D&S Consultant, Chattogram;
- Mr. Md. Limon Arefin, Field Supervisor, Sitakunda & Mirsharai UZs, D&S Consultant, Chattogram;
- Mr. Md. Rezaul Karim, Field Supervisor, Sitakunda & Mirsharai UZs, D&S Consultant, Chattogram.

CONTRACTORS' PERSONNEL – NW-03B: M/S Sarker Steel Ltd.

- Mr. Mohammad Roman, Site Engineer.

CONTRACTORS' PERSONNEL – NW-10: M/S Wahid Construction Ltd.

- Mr. Syed Tamzid Alam, Project Engineer;
- Mr. Md. Mahboob Al Nasir, Deputy Project Manager;
- Mr. Mehedi Hasan Bappi, Assistant Project Manager;
- Mr. Md. Aftab Hossain, ESSO (Environment & Social Safety Officer);
- Mr. Md. Sohan Molla, ESSO (Environment & Social Safety Officer);
- Mr. Abdul Halim, SSO (Safety & Security Officer);
- Mr. Mohd. Moniruzzaman, Site Engineer;
- Mr. Mohd. Zakaria, Site Engineer;

- Mr. Md. Shahinul Islam, Site Engineer;
- Mr. Md. Ruhul Amin Bappi, Site Engineer.

SMCs

- Mr. Md. Faridul Alam, Head Master, Sukchari Rahmania GPS at Lohagara UZ;
- Mr. Md. Ridwanul Hoque, Assistant Teacher, Sukchari Rahmania GPS at Lohagara UZ;
- Mr. S.M. Ishaq, Head Master, 106 No. Uttar Sadaha GPS at Satkania UZ;
- Mr. Md. Ziauddin Babu, Assistant Teacher, 66 No. Purbo Bajalia GPS at Satkania UZ;
- Mr. Omit Kumar Pal, Assistant Teacher, S.M. Pilot GPS at Sitakunda UZ;
- Mr. Mohd. Alauddin, Head Master, Padua GPS at Mirsharai UZ.

6. Activities of Visit : **Monitoring of the Implementation Activities of MDSP**

7. Sites visited: 10 nos. of “New construction of shelter sites” [3 nos. of Steel Pkg. & 7 nos. of RCC Pkg.] were visited:

Package no. LGED/MDSP/CHI/14-15/NW-03B (New Construction – Steel):

- CTGP-3220: Sukchari Rahmania GPS cum CS at Lohagara UZ;
- CTGP-1004: 66 No. Purbo Bajalia GPS cum CS at Satkania UZ;
- CTGP-576: Safiullah Para GPS cum CS at Mirsharai UZ.

Package no. LGED/MDSP/CHI/14-15/NW-10 (New Construction – RCC):

- CTGP-1497: Mostafa Begum GPS cum CS at Lohagara UZ;
- CTGP-1051: 106 No. Uttar Sadaha GPS cum CS at Satkania UZ;
- CTGP-1061: 17 No. Purbo Nalua GPS cum CS at Satkania UZ;
- CTGP-1087: S.M. Pilot GPS cum CS at Sitakunda UZ;
- CTGP-1100: 86 No. Purbo Lalanagor GPS cum CS at Sitakunda UZ;
- CTGP-589: Padua GPS cum CS at Mirsharai UZ;
- CTGP-1504: Badulla Shelter GPS cum CS at Mirsharai UZ.

8. **Findings and Observations of M&E Consultants:**

A. General:

The M&E Consultants undertake the field visits as part of its obligation to perform the following:

- Overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation activities;
- Carry out independent monitoring of project progress, inputs, outputs and outcomes and impact of project interventions at different point time;

- c) Supervise compliance of social and environmental safeguards;
- d) Propose recommendations for appropriate corrective actions, if any.

B. Findings and Observations on New Construction Packages

i) Package NW-03B [Steel Structure]

The package was awarded to M/S Sarker Steel on 09 March 2020. This was targeted to be completed within a period of 16 months i.e. on 28 July 2021.

Physical progress of works of the package has been extremely slow. D&S Consultants [Engineer] issued 'Notice to Correct under GC Sub Clause 15.1' and also 'Notice of Failure to Comply with Notice to Correct'. The originally scheduled contract period expired on 28th July 2021. The first extension expired on 31st December 2021. As the Contract was nearing the extended time, the Contractor applied for a 2nd EOT. The Second EOT was given up to 30 April 2022. Having failed to comply with the 2nd EOT, the Contractor further applied for 3rd EOT which is valid up to 31 December, 2022.

The M&E team visited 3 nos. steel shelter sites at Lohagara, Satkania and Mirsharai upazilas of Chattogram district.

Physical Progress

- 22 nos. out of total 25 nos. sites of the package has been handed over to the contractor. Physical works has been taken up in all 22 sites of **NW-03B**. 3 nos. sites are yet to be handed over to the contractor on land and other issues. Settling issues, the sites should be handed over to the contractor although time of completion of the project is limited.
- The reported physical progress of the construction of the visited 3 nos. new shelter works are as follows: **CTGP-3200: 20%; CTGP-1004: 20% and CTGP-576: 43.50%**.
- As of end of November 2022, overall physical progress of the package **NW-03B** is **27.50%** against the revised target of **97%** (in terms of time allowed). It shows that the physical progress of the package is lagging much behind the schedule. A further extension will therefore be inevitable on condition that the contractor will fully engage itself in accelerating construction activities aiming completion by the extended period.
- Visualizing implementation activities, the slow progress of the package appears to be the negligence of the contractor, although the effect of COVID-19 may be termed partly responsible. In any case, construction program needs to be immediately re-scheduled targeting completion within project period and all action to complete works must be ensured by all concerned.
(Photo: 01)



General Observations

- **Site selection:** Selection of most of the sites for construction of new shelters has been good as these are indeed located in cyclone vulnerable remote places of the district.
- **Mobilization by the Contractor:** At initial stage, M/S. Sarker Steel Ltd. did make fairly good mobilization of field personnel i.e., Project Manager, Project Engineers, ESSO, Site Engineers and other support staffs but presently there is some site engineers at some sites. None of the Contractor's senior personnel except only one site engineer was available during our visit.

Mobilization activity includes the construction of site offices, installation of tube wells, labor sheds, store sheds, toilets, demarcating waste disposal areas and mobilizing necessary machineries etc. Although some of the items were more or less mobilized at initial stage, but at present, most of these items were not seen except some dilapidated site offices and labor sheds. **(Photo: 02)**



- **Construction Schedule:** None of the Contractor's senior personnel except one site engineer was met during our visit. No updated construction schedule was seen at any site. Updated construction schedule for the whole package as well as individual structures should be immediately prepared and adhered to for timely completion.
- **Site Plan:** No site plan demarcating construction area, storage yard of construction materials, labour sheds, tube wells and toilets for construction labours, waste disposal sites etc. was available at any working site.
- Overall management of works by the Contractor in terms of proper planning and execution of the ICB contract packages appear very poor.

Observations on the Construction Works

- There was no physical activity except CTGP-576. CTGP-3220 seems to be cow pasture.
- Construction works of all the sites visited are still limited to foundation works only **(Photo: 03)**.



- However, at **CTGP-576**, erection work has gained some progress although no physical activity was reported in the recent past (**Photo: 04**).



- Installation of 3 nos. of Deep Tube-wells and 1 No. of Submersible Pump have been done in **CTGP-576**.
- The quality of construction materials such as MS rod, stone chips, coarse sand etc. procured at sites appears good.
- MS Rod should be stored on raised platform to avoid mud and water in **CTGP-576** (**Photo: 05**).



- Concrete work in CTGP-576, the quality of concrete work Appears poor (**Photo: 06**)



- Labour sheds have been constructed in all visited shelter sites (**Photo: 07**) except **CTGP-3220**. Site offices have been constructed in all visited shelter sites except **CTGP-576**. The site offices are not suitable for uses (**Photo: 08**).



Shelter Wise Progress

The physical work of the package is still limited to foundation work only except **CTGP-576**. Foundation work up to grade beam level mainly include i) Casting of required nos. of cast-in-situ piles; ii) Pile cap casting including bracing beams; iii) Pedestal column casting up to grade beams and iv) Grade beam casting.

- **CTGP-3220:** All 67 nos. cast-in-situ piles of lengths of 20 m and diameter 500 mm have been cast. Pile Load Test has been done but Pile Integrity Test has not been done. It was learnt that there has been no activity since piling works completed on 21 January 2021. The site appears barren (**Photo: 09**).



- **CTGP-1004:** All the 67 nos. cast-in situ piles of lengths of 20 m and diameter of 500 mm have been cast. There was no physical activity since 26 March 2021 (**Photo: 10**).



- **CTGP-576:** Foundation work up to grade beams casting has been done. Steel Structure erection work up to 2nd floor is ongoing. Installation of Deep Tube wells (3 nos.) and 1 no. Submersible Pump has been done.

Construction of Shelter Connecting Road: There is no provision of constructing shelter connecting roads in steel structure packages.

ii) **Package NW-10 [RCC]**

The work was awarded to M/S. Wahid Construction Ltd. On 09 March 2020. It was scheduled to be completed by 24 months i.e., on 15 June 2022.

Work progress has been extremely slow despite repeated advice to expedite work. D&S Consultants have issued 'Notice to Correct under GC Sub Clause 15.1 and the Notice of Failure to Comply with Notice to Correct.' The original contract period expired on 15 June 2022, and an EOT has been granted up to 31 May 2023.

The M&E team visited 7 nos. under construction new RCC shelter sites in Lohagara, Satkania, Sitakunda and Mirsharai upazilas of Chattogram district.

Physical Progress

- 71 nos. structure sites out of total 73 nos. have been made over to the contractor. Physical work has been taken up in 64 sites. So far, piling work has been completed in 51 sites and only so called preparatory works like fencing works are ongoing in the remaining sites.
- The reported physical progress of the construction of the visited 7 new shelter sites are as follows: **CTGP-1497: 23.5%; CTGP-1051: 20.5%; CTGP-1061: 24.5%; CTGP-1087: 23.2%; CTGP-1100: 23.5%; CTGP-589: 25.5% and CTGP-1504: 20.5%.**
- As of end of November 2022, overall physical progress of the package is **24.50%** against the revised target of **83%** (in terms of time allowed). It shows that the physical progress of the package is extremely poor.
- Although the COVID-19 is partly responsible for the slow progress, the negligence of the contractor is equally responsible. In any case, construction program need to be immediately re-scheduled targeting completion within project period and all action to complete works must be ensured by all concerned.

General Observations

- **Site selection:** Selection of all sites for construction of new shelters has been good as these are indeed located in cyclone vulnerable remote places of the district.
- **Staff Mobilization by the Contractor:** At initial stage, M/S. Wahid Construction Ltd. made fairly good mobilization of field personnel like Project Manager, Project Engineers, ESSO, Site Engineers and other support staffs etc. Presently, more and less all field staffs have been found available.
- **Construction Schedule:** No updated construction schedule for the package as a whole and individual site was available at any working site. The updated construction schedule should be immediately done and followed.

- **Site Plan:** No site plan showing the demarcated storage yard of construction materials, labour sheds, tube wells and toilets for construction labours, re-bar fabrication yard, waste disposal areas etc. was available at any working site. As a result, unplanned and haphazard construction activities were observed (**Photo: 11**).



- Overall management by the Contractor in terms of proper planning and execution of the ICB contract package appears poor. However, newly appointed Project Manager appeared enthusiastic. He committed to accelerate progress of works for completion in time taking special care.

Observations on the Construction Works

- Construction works at the visited shelter sites are still limited to foundation works up to grade beams level.
- Laboratory tests of MS rod, coarse sand, cement etc. have been done. Test reports have been available in the field and test results are O.K.
- The quality of construction materials such as MS rod, stone chips, coarse sand etc. procured at sites appears good but procured stone chips at **CTGP-589** are found mixed with dust (**Photo: 12**).



- Excavated earth has been stacked irregularly and haphazardly. Advised to immediately to remove the garbage waste from construction site (**Photo: 13**).



- MS rod and steel props has not been properly stacked (**Photo: 14**).



- Site offices have not yet been constructed in any of the shelter sites. Labour sheds in some shelter sites are found unusable (**Photo: 15**).



Shelter Wise Progress

The physical work of the package is still limited foundation work up to grade beam only. Foundation work up to grade beam level mainly include i) Casting of required nos. of cast-in-situ piles; ii) Pile cap casting including bracing beams; iii) Pedestal column casting up to grade beams and iv) Grade beam casting. Works in the visited shelter sites are still limited to casting of pile caps only.

- **CTGP-1497:** Pile caps casting is ongoing. There has been no physical activity at site since 8 November 2022 (**Photo: 16**).



- **CTGP-1051:** All the 70 nos. cast-in situ piles of lengths of 20 m and diameter of 500 mm have been cast) Pile Load test has been done, but Pile Integrity test has yet to be done. No physical activity was observed (**Photo: 17**).



- **CTGP-1061:** Pile caps casting including bracing beams and pedestal columns are in progress. No physical activity was also seen (**Photo: 18**).



- **CTGP-1087:** Pile caps casting including bracing beams was in progress. No physical work was going on since 21 October 2022 (**Photo: 19**).



- **CTGP-1100:** Casting of pedestal columns was in progress. No physical activity was seen (**Photo: 20**).



- **CTGP-589:** Pedestal columns casting was in progress (**Photo: 21**). Installation of Deep Tube well (Environment) was going on (**Photo: 22**).



- **CTGP-1504:** All the 75nos. cast-in situ piles of lengths of 20 m and diameter of 500 mm have been cast) Pile Load test and Pile Integrity test have not yet been done. There has been no activity since 1 year (**Photo: 23**).



Shelter Connecting Road (SCR)

There is no provision of Shelter Connecting Roads in any shelter site we visited and so there was no road construction activity.

C. Environmental Safety Measures

The project activity would ensure that environmental safety considerations are given sufficient attention into project design of cyclone shelters. To this end, Environmental Assessment (EA) for all rehabilitation of existing cyclone shelters under the package have been carried out by the D&S consultants and concurred by the WB. The EA has chalked out specific EMP measures to address the environmental safety aspect. 8 (eight) nos. environmental safety measures have been suggested for the package involving rehabilitation of 130 nos. shelters.

These are: a) First aid box; b) Dust suppression measures; c) Working labour shed; d) Project sign board; e) Safety gear package; f) Temporary sanitary latrine; g) water filter and h) site cleaning.

There is provision of itemised cost for performing environmental safety activities.

Compliance of Environmental Safety Measures.

Our observations during the field visit on the general compliance of the EMPs are as follows:

In general, compliance of environmental safety measures have been found to be neglected in most of the sites.

a) **Sign Board:** Sign boards describing structure features have been found in most of the sites.

b) **Fencing:** Safety fencing are in dilapidated condition in most of the sites (**Photo: 24**).



c) **First Aid Box:** First aid boxes were found at all sites. At some sites however, the boxes did not contain all required contents.

d) **Dust Suppression Measures:** Sand stored in some of the sites has been covered but grasses have grown on sand stone heap at CTGP-3220 (**Photo: 25**)



e) **Labor Shed:** In most sites, Labor sheds have been constructed but at some sites, these are poor condition, (**Photo: 26**).



f) **Safety Gear Package:** Safety gear materials (hand gloves, helmets, eye protection glasses, rubber shoes light reflecting dresses, etc.) were found in most of the visited shelter sites. It is important to motivate all the labours to use safety gears.

g) **Temporary Sanitary Latrine:** Sanitary latrines have been built but the quality need improvement. (**Photo: 27**).



h) **Water Filter:** Water filters were found in each shelter but due to long use, these are often in functional condition

- i) **Site Cleaning:** This item is meant to keep the site clean during and after construction. This item has generally been neglected. **(Photo: 28).**



- j) **Construction of Temporary School:** Construction of temporary sheds have been built where necessary but some of them are in use **(Photo: 29)** while in places it remains abandoned **(Photo: 30)**



D. Compliance of Social Safety Measures

Primarily social safety measure relating to shelter construction and shelter connecting road works include the availability of land for construction works and if there is any incidence of re-settlement of PAPs. We were informed that there is no need land acquisition and there is no issue of re-settlement of PAPs.

However, as the progress of works is very slow, there is strong resentment amongst the SMC, teachers and students for the sufferings they are facing in running the general school activities.

As physical activities and presence of contractors workers and staff are very limited, the issues of community engagement, community complaints and grievance management, labor complaints grievance management etc. are virtually not being given proper attention to.

F. Conclusion.

We would recommend to PMU, D&S consultants and related stakeholders to please overview our observations given above and take necessary measures as deemed appropriate.

Finally, we express our appreciation and hearty thanks to the field personnel of LGED, the DS Consultants, School Authorities, Teachers and the Contractor for their kind cooperation extended to us during the field visit.



A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,
Team Leader, M&E Consultants,
MDSP, LGED