

MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)
Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Consultant

FIELD VISIT REPORT

1. Period of Visit : 06 November 2018
2. Location of Visit : Feni District.
3. Participant of visit : A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman, TL, M&E Consultant,
Md. Matiur Rahman, Civil Engineer/ M&E Specialist, M&E Consultant,
4. Officials met during Visit :

D&S CONSULTANTS

- Mr. Prabodh Kumar Munshi, RRE, Noakhali Region, D&S Consultant, Feni
- Mr. Md. Asaduzzaman, Field Resident Engineer, Feni,
- Mr. Mohd. Shimul Khan, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, Feni,
- Mr. Arefin Lemon, Field Supervisor, D&S Consultant, Feni,

CONTRACTORS' PERSONNEL

- Mr. Md. Mozibul Islam, Project Engineer, M/S. The Builders Engineers Associates Ltd., Pkgs. LGED/MDSP/FENI/2015-2016/NCB/NW-03 & LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/W-03.
- Mr. Md. Mahmudul Hasan, Project Engineer, M/S. SS-AE JV., Pkgs. LGED/MDSP/FENI/2015-2016/NCB/NW-01 & NW-02
- Mr. Riton Chakma, Site Engineer, M/S. SS-AE JV., Pkgs. LGED/MDSP/FENI/2015-2016/NCB/NW-01 & NW-02
- Mr. Omit Banik, Accountant, M/S. SS-AE JV., Pkgs. LGED/MDSP/FENI/2015-2016/NCB/NW-01 & NW-02

5. Activities of Visit : **Monitoring the Field Activities of MDSP**
6. Sites visited: 2 nos. of "rehabilitation of existing shelter sites" and 5 nos. of "new construction of shelter sites" including 1 no. of shelter connecting road were visited: -

Package no. LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/W-03 (Rehabilitation):

- FEE-86:** 50 No. Saraitkandi GPS cum CS at Sonagazi UZ,
FEE-87: 54 No. Monagazi GPS cum CS at Sonagazi UZ,

Package no. LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/NW-01(New construction):

- FEP-341: Shulakhali Khaza Ahmed GPS cum CS at Sonagazi UZ,
FEP-335: Palgiri Ibne Ali Akbar GPS cum CS at Sonagazi UZ,

Package no. LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/NW-02(New Construction):

- FEP-014: Purbo Pathannagar GPS cum CS at Chagalnaiya UZ,

Package no. LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/NW-03(New Construction):

- FEP-181: Char Kalidas GPS cum CS at Feni Sadar UZ,
FEP-201: Paschim Bosikpur GPS cum CS at Fulgazi UZ,

7. Findings and Observations of the M&E Consultants:

A. General:

The M&E Consultants undertake the field visits as part of its obligation to perform the following:

- a) Overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation activities;
- b) Carry out independent monitoring of project progress, inputs, outputs and outcomes and impact of project interventions at different point time;
- c) Supervise compliance of social and environmental safeguards;
- d) Propose recommendations for appropriate corrective actions, if any.

B. Physical works:

i) Rehabilitation of Existing Shelters

LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/W-03

It is a NCB contract package in Feni consisting of rehabilitation of 20 nos. existing shelters. Major physical works for rehabilitation of shelters include roof top screeding, lean concreting & patent stone casting, outside and inside plastering works, outside and inside painting works, school furniture supply, construction/ re-construction of boundary wall as and where necessary, repair of staircases, supplying and fixing of ventilator grills and veranda grills, installation of M.S. Grill Swing Gate as necessary, construction/ cleaning of septic tanks, repair of toilets, installation of deep tube-wells, electrification works and back filling works etc. as required.

The M&E team visited 2 nos. of existing shelter sites in Sonagazi upazila of Feni district.

Field visit observations:

- **Construction Schedule:** No construction schedule of the contact package as also of individual shelter site was available. This is an essential instrument to program and monitor the construction activities at sites. Overall Package Construction Schedule along with site specific construction schedule showing the dates of actual implementation of the various work elements against targets should have been prepared and monitored by the responsible persons. Lot of

emphasis was given to this aspect during our earlier visits. Unfortunately, this has not been given due attention. The completion date of the contract expired on 24 September 2018.

- **Site Plan:** No site plan showing the demarcated storage yard of construction materials, labour sheds, tube wells and toilets for construction labours, waste disposal sites etc. was available at site. Site Plan is an essential element in respect of environmental aspect as well as social aspect during construction activities.
- **Rehabilitation Need Assessment:** Assessment of the rehabilitation needs of the shelters should have been more exhaustive targeting overall and sustained stability of the infrastructures instead of doing some patch repair works.
- **Contractor's Technical Personnel:** No resource person other than the Contractor's Project Engineer was met during the field visit.

Overall site management by the Contractor in terms of proper planning and execution appears poor.

No site office and labour shed have been constructed.

Physical progress

Out of the 20 nos. shelters under the package, works of 12 nos. shelters have been taken up and remaining 8 nos. still remaining untouched. The overall physical progress of the 12 nos. ongoing shelters is reported to be about 90%. The fate of the remaining 8 nos. shelters is uncertain.

Shelter wise progress

Item wise Progress status of the sites visited:

- **Roof Top Screeding:** Done in both FEE-87 & FEE-86 (**Photo: 01**)

Photo: 01



- **Floor Casting:** Completed at ground floor/ 1st floor of FEE-87 & FEE-86. The surface of the floor of FEE-86 has developed some scattered holes (**Photo: 02**). Curative measures should be taken.

Photo: 02



- **Brick Work:** Completed at parapet wall in FEE-87.

- **Repair of Staircase:** Done in FEE-87 & FEE-86. The stair railing of FEE-87 has sharp saw type steel plate which is dangerous and may cause accident at any moment (**Photo: 03**). It is not understood why the saw plate has been kept on the repaired railing. It should be removed.



- **Outside & Inside Plastering Works** (Patch repair works where necessary): Done in FEE-87 & FEE-86.

- **Reconstruction of Toilet:** Completed in FEE-87 & FEE-86 (**Photo: 04**)



- **Construction/ Re-construction of Septic Tank:** Ongoing in FEE-87 (**Photo: 05**)



- **Installation of Deep Tube-well:** Work is also ongoing in FEE-87 (**Photo: 06**).



- **Construction of Apron:** Done in FEE-87 but the workmanship should have been more improved. (**Photo: 07**)



- **Outside & Inside Painting Works:** Works completed in FEE-87 and is still ongoing in FEE-86 (**Photo: 08**)



- **Supplying and fixing of Ventilator / Veranda Grills and Collapsible Gate:** Done in FEE-87 & FEE-86 (**Photo: 09**)



- **Electrification Works:** Done in FEE-87 & FEE-86 (**Photo: 10**). The quality of electrification fittings should be improved.



- **School Furniture Supply:** Only high and low benches of Tanin Brand have been supplied in FEE-87 & FEE-86 (**Photo: 11**). Other furniture such as Chairs and tables for the teachers, Steel Almirah etc. should also be supplied.



ii) Construction of New Shelters including Shelter Connecting Road

Package no. LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/NW-03

The package includes construction of 6 nos. School cum shelters. Construction of all the shelters have been completed (**Photo: 12**) & (**Photo: 13**). The overall quality of the completed shelters is good. Bank protection works on the pond both in front and back of the structure has been rightly done.



Package no. LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/NW-01 and LGED/MDSP/FENI/15-16/NW-01 & NW-02

The original target dates of completion of the two packages was 31 December 2017. As the planned progress could not be achieved, completion dates of the packages 01 & 02 have been extended by 12 months i.e. up to 31 December 2018.

As of end of October 2018, cumulative physical progress against revised targets are as follows:

<u>Package</u>	<u>Cumulative Targets</u>	<u>Achievements</u>
NW-01:	97%	32.30%
NW 02:	97%	43.50%

Shelter Wise Progress

The physical works in the visited shelter sites is still limited to casting of columns at ground floor up to 1st floor slab casting. Observations on the shelter wise progress is stated below:

- **FEP-341:** The physical progress is 32%. The shelter site looks like an abandoned site. It has been stated that there had been no physical work since 24 February 2018. Columns at ground floor have been cast (**Photo: 14**). Ramp construction (**Photo: 15**) including 2 nos. of underground water tanks have also been casted.



Installation of Deep Tube-wells (4 nos.) have been done (**Photo: 16**). It was informed that the SMC has temporarily taken out the head of the tube well to avoid theft.



- **FEP-335:** Up to date progress is 52%. No physical work has been done for the last ten days, as reported. Shutter placement for 2nd floor slab casting was in progress (**Photo: 17**). Ramp construction including 2 nos. of underground water tanks have been casted. However, the quality of work so far done is good.



Installation of Deep Tube-wells (4 nos.) has been completed.

- **FEP-014:** Physical progress is 44%. Shutter placement for 1st floor slab casting is going on (**Photo: 18**). Ramp construction including 2 nos. of underground water tanks have been casted. Installation of Deep Tube-wells (4 nos.) has been completed.



Still a lot of physical works need to be done to complete the shelters. The progress of work is so disappointing.

Shelter Connecting Road (SCR)

- Relating to **FEP-201**, there is a provision of construction of shelter connecting road for a length 253m with one no. (1 vent) box culvert. The SCR has already been completed (**Photo: 19**). The pallasiding work attached to the culvert to protect the SCR has been slightly tilted (**Photo: 20**).



C. Compliance of Environmental Safety Measures.

The following is our observation on the compliance of the environmental safety measures:

- By and large, the compliance of environmental safety aspect is disappointing particularly on the ongoing sites. No Community Organizer was met in the field. As there was little activity in the field, the measures have been overlooked.
- In **FEP-341**, the boundary fences have been found damaged site remains wide open (**Photo: 21**).



- In both completed shelters FEP-181 & FEP-201, tree plantation has been done. (**Photo: 22**)



- As provision of contract, construction garbage has been removed from the completed shelter sites.

D. Conclusion

We would recommend to PMU, D&S consultants and related stakeholders to please consider our observations given above and take necessary measures as deemed appropriate.

Finally, we express our deep appreciation and thanks to the field personnel of LGED, the DS Consultants and the Contractors for their kind cooperation extended to us during the field visit.

A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,
Team Leader, M&E Consultants,
MDSP, LGED