



MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)

(IDA Credit No.5561 BD)

Monitoring and Evaluation Consultancy Services

Local Government Engineering Department (LGED)

To
The Chief Engineer,
LGED, Dhaka.

Date : 20.06.2022
Our ref : MDSP-M&E/FVR/88
Dealt by : Team Leader

Subject : Field Visit Report of the M&E Consultants of MDSP in Noakhali District.

Sir,

I have the pleasure to submit herewith the Field Visit Report of the M&E Consultants on the

1. 'Construction of New Shelter cum School' under MDSP in Noakhali district (Contract Package No. LGED/MDSP/NOA/14-15/NW-09); and
2. 'Rehabilitation of Existing School cum Shelter' under MDSP in Noakhali district (Contract Package No. LGED/MDSP/NOA/2016-2017/W-05).

The M&E Consultant team of MDSP undertook the visit in Noakhali district on 07-08 June, 2022.

This is for favor of your kind disposal.

Regards.

Sincerely yours,

A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,
Team Leader,
M&E Consultants,
MDSP, LGED.

Encl.:- Field Visit Report

- CC:
1. Project Director, MDSP, LGED, Dhaka.
 2. Deputy Project Director, MDSP, LGED, Dhaka.
 3. Executive Engineer, LGED, Noakhali district, Noakhali.
 4. Upazilla Engineer, Kabirhat UZ, LGED, Kabirhat, Noakhali.
 5. Upazilla Engineer, Subornachar UZ, LGED, Subornochar, Noakhali.
 6. Upazilla Engineer, Begumganj UZ, LGED, Begumganj, Noakhali.
 7. Team Leader, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, Dhaka.
 8. Dy. Team Leader, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, Dhaka
 9. Field Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, MDSP, LGED, Noakhali district, Noakhali.
 10. Ignacio Urrutia, TTL, MDSP, WB, Dhaka.
 11. Swarna Kazi, Co-TTL, MDSP, WB, Dhaka.
 12. Md. S.M.Zulkernine, Environment Specialist, WB, Dhaka.
 13. Md. Akter Zaman, Social Development Specialist, WB, Dhaka.
 14. Md. Rafiqul Islam, Consultant, WB, Dhaka

MULTIPURPOSE DISASTER SHELTER PROJECT (MDSP)

Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Consultant

FIELD VISIT REPORT

1. Period of Visit : 07 June – 08 June 22
2. Location of Visit : Noakhali District.
3. Participant of visit : A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman, TL, M&E Consultant,
Md. Matiur Rahman, Civil Engineer/ M&E Specialist, M&E Consultant,
4. Officials met during Visit :

LGED OFFICIALS

- Mr. A. B. M. Asaduzzaman, Assistant Engineer, MDSP, LGED, Noakhali

D&S CONSULTANTS

- Mr. Shailen Chandra Das, Field Resident Engineer, Noakhali,
- Mr. Md. Akhteruzzaman, Field Supervisor, Noakhali,
- Mr. Md. Mohsin Alam, Field Supervisor, Noakhali,
- Mr. Md. Rezaul Karim, Field Supervisor, Noakhali.

CONTRACTORS' PERSONNEL:

- (i) **Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/NOA/14-15/NW-09 (New Construction)**

Contractor: M/S Toma Construction & Co. Ltd

- Mr. Md. Mosaraf Hossain, Project Manager

- (ii) **Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/NOA/16-17/W-05 (Rehabilitation):**

Contractor: M/S MR-RT JV

- None

SMC

- Mr. Mohd. Giash Uddin, Assistant. Teacher, Hiromi GPS GPS at Suborno Char UZ,
- Mrs. Jannatul Ferdous, Member, SMC, Hiromi GPS GPS at Suborno Char UZ,
- Mrs. Joitunnesa, Head Master, Dakhin Char Kazi Mokles GPS at Suborno Char UZ,
- Mrs. Jugli Mojumder, Assistant. Teacher, Purbo Char Amanullah GPS at Suborno Char UZ,
- Mr. Sadesh Bihari Nath, Head Master (In-charge), Char Mohiuddin GPS at Suborno Char UZ,

- Mr. Md. Harun-Ar- Rashid, Head Master, Uttar Lamsi GPS at Kabirhat UZ,
- Mrs. Mahenur Akter, Head Master, 94 No. Norottampur Muslim GPS at Kabirhat UZ,
- Mr. Md. Emam Uddin, Head Master, 125 No. Paschim Lautili GPS at Begumgonj UZ.

5. Activities of Visit : **Monitoring of the Implementation Activities of MDSP**

6. Sites visited: 7 nos. of “New construction of shelter sites” and 2 nos. of “Rehabilitation of existing shelter sites” were visited:

Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/NOA/14-15/NW-09 (New Construction):

- NOAP- 364:** Heromi GPS cum CS, Suborno Char UZ.
- NOAP- 363:** Dakhin Char Kazi Mokles GPS cum CS, Suborno Char UZ.
- NOAP- 336:** Purbo Char Amanullah GPS cum CS, Suborno Char UZ.
- NOAP- 376:** Char Mohiuddin GPS cum CS, Suborno Char UZ.
- NOAP- 210:** Uttar Lamsi GPS cum CS, Kabirhat UZ.
- NOAP- 203:** 94 No. Norottampur Muslim GPS cum CS, Kabirhat UZ.
- NOAP- 47:** 125 No. Paschim Lautoli GPS cum CS, Begumganj UZ.

Pkg. No. LGED/MDSP/NOA/16-17/W-05 (Rehabilitation):

- NOAE- 252:** Char Amanullah GPS cum CS at Suborno Char UZ.
- NOAE- 276:** Char Mohiuddin GPS cum CS at Suborno Char UZ.

7. **Findings and Observations of the M&E Consultants:**

A. General:

The M&E Consultants undertake the field visits as part of its obligation to perform the following:

- Overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation activities;
- Carry out independent monitoring of project progress, inputs, outputs and outcomes and impact of project interventions at different point time;
- Supervise compliance of social and environmental safeguards;
- Propose recommendations for appropriate corrective actions, if any.

B. Package Description.

The M&E Consultants visited the following shelter sites:

Package NW- 09:

It is an ICB package. It covers construction of 35 nos. new shelters and shelter connecting roads where necessary in Noakhali District. The work was awarded to M/S Toma Construction and

Company Ltd. on 17 September 2017 fixing target completion date as 11 November 2019. As the desired progress could not be achieved, completion date of the package had been extended up to 30 April 2022.

The M&E team visited 7 nos. of new shelter sites of MDSP at Suborno Char, Kabirhat and Begumganj Upazilas of Noakhali district.

Physical Progress

- Out of total 35 nos. of new shelters, 20 nos. shelters have been completed and handed over to SMCs while 13 others are ready for handing over as reported by the field officials. Works are still going on in remaining 2 shelter sites.
- The physical progress of the construction of the 7 new shelters we visited are as follows:
Completed and handed over to the SMCs: NOAP- 364: 100%; NOAP- 363: 100%; NOAP- 336: 100% and NOAP- 376: 100%.
Nearly completed and waiting for handed over to the SMCs: NOAP- 210: 98%; NOAP- 203: 98% and NOAP- 47: 98%. (Photo: 01)

Photo-01



- As of end of May 2022, overall physical progress of the package is **99%** against the revised target of **100%**.

Shelter Connecting Roads

There is provision of Shelter Connecting Road (SCR) of various lengths as mentioned below:

- **NOAP- 364: SCR = 482 m**
- **NOAP- 363: SCR = 730 m**
- **NOAP- 336: SCR = 745 m**
- **NOAP- 203: SCR = 300 m**

Construction works of the shelter connecting roads have not been taken up as yet **(Photo: 02)**.

Photo-02



C. Evaluation of the completed Shelter Buildings

Architectural Look of the Shelter Buildings: The newly completed shelter cum school buildings have very nice look (**Photo: 03**). The completed shelters have provision of all modern facilities like water supply, sanitary toilet, electric power supply, solar power supply, rain water harvesting arrangements, underground water storage reservoir, dedicated floor with ramp for livestock accommodation, metaled internal road, shelter access road, supply of new furniture for teachers and students etc. These will indeed create confidence amongst the stakeholders to take shelter during devastating cyclone fore-casts. The new structure will also create a very congenial school environment. The overall quality of works of the shelters is good (**Photo: 04**).



• Functioning of the Water Supply and Sanitary System in Completed Shelters:

The designed water supply system in the shelters is as follows: 2 nos. DTWs at the ground floor; 2 nos. DTWs at the first floor; 2 nos. hand pumps on the 2nd floor collecting water from the underground water tank. The submersible pump supplies water to underground water tank and also to 4 nos. overhead tank. The remaining 2 nos. overhead tanks collect water through rain water harvesting system as also from the attached overhead tanks.

The main source of water supply to the toilets is the overhead tanks receiving water from the submersible pump. In **NOAP- 364**, the total water supply system is working properly as reported by the school authorities. (**Photo: 05**)



But in many other completed shelters, the **submersible pumps** and other pumps are not working properly. As a result, there is no supply of water in the toilets (**Photo: 06**). It has been reported that water is being fetched by the students by buckets from ground or 1st floor for use in the toilets. This is inhuman. All the **submersible pumps** must be kept fully operative to keep the whole water supply and sanitary system functioning properly creating a good hygienic environment.



DTWs were found in operation in some shelters (**Photo: 07**) while in many other shelters these were found inoperative in GF and 1st floor. (**Photo: 08**) Due care must be given to keep the DTWs in operation.



In **NOAP- 376**, debris and wooden shutter materials in the underground water tank were not reportedly cleaned before filling the tank with water. The underground water reservoir must be fully cleaned

In **NOAP- 363**, one toilet is absolutely unusable because of presence of some hard material blocking the pan passage. It should be rectified by the contractor.

- **Fixing of Windows.** Adhesive materials have not been used in the gaps between walls and Thai Aluminum window frames in **NOAP- 47** resulting flushing of rain water.

Electrification System

The newly installed electrification system is complete. Fans, lights etc. are working properly (**Photo: 09**). The solar power system has also been found working properly.



D. Environmental Safety Measures in New Shelters

The BoQ provided as many as 12 items related to environmental safety measures as identified during environmental assessment of subprojects. In addition, the provision of the item 'Construction of Temporary Shed for Uninterrupted Schooling' is made where necessary.

The 12 nos. BoQ items are:

- ***First Aid Box;***
- ***Protective Fencing;***
- ***Vegetation and Tree Plantation;***
- ***Water Filter;***
- ***Safety Gear Package;***
- ***Temporary Sanitary Latrine;***
- ***Temporary Camp Site Waste Disposal Facility;***
- ***Dust Suppression Measures;***
- ***Environmental and Social/Safeguard Personnel;***
- ***Health/Safety Warning Sign;***
- ***Tube Well.***
- ***Site Cleaning.***

Most of the above items were more or less done during construction period. The post construction items include:

Tree Plantation:

Tree plantation has been done in the premises of the completed shelters but the survival rate is very disappointing.

NOAP - 364: 20 nos. plants were planted but none survived. It was reported that 60 nos. plants were cut before structure construction.

NOAP- 363: 40 nos. plants were planted but presently none survived.

NOAP 47 & NOAP- 210: Plantation has been done but the saplings were found very weak and likely to die soon (**Photo: 10**).



Tree plantation should be done afresh protected by safety gabions and should be properly nursed till initial growth.

Water Filter:

Inferior quality water filters have been supplied as reported by the school authorities. Good quality water filters should be provided.

Site Cleaning:

Before handing over the completed structure, the site should be neatly cleaned so that the students can use the premises as playground. This has not been done in some of the shelters. This should be done so that the students can use the playground. (**Photo: 11**).



E. Social Safety Measures

The SMC is composed of the local elites who take keen interest in education. The Head Master/Head Mistress is an important member of the SMC. During our visits to different completed shelter buildings, we had interaction with some of the SMC members. The SMC members particularly the Head Master/Head Mistress of the completed shelter cum school buildings informed with happiness that due to construction of the new shelter buildings in the school premises, the prolonged need of improvement of the dilapidated school buildings has been met. This along with supply of school logistics will greatly create good environment for improved schooling activities.

They however, put below mentioned observations on the newly completed shelter buildings:

- **Community engagement in the Shelter Construction Process.**

It was informed that the participation of the SMCs was ensured in the full process of construction of the shelters.

- **Land Availability:** There was no land dispute in any shelter as these were constructed in existing Government school premises.

- **Participation of the SMC in the Shelter Hand over Process.**

In the shelter hand over process by LGED, the SMC was involved. SMCs and the students are indeed very happy to get a beautiful 3 storey structure for schooling purposes which was a longtime dream for them. However, copies of the shelter hand over documents were reportedly not given to the SMCs as yet. It should be provided.

- **Furniture Supply:** Furniture like steel almirah, table and chairs for teachers, high and low benches with book shelves for students have been supplied in the completed shelters.

However, supply of high benches without book shelves have been made in **NOAP-210** and **NOAP- 203**. (Photo: 12). It was learnt that letter for replacing these benches has been issued by LGED. No furniture has yet been supplied yet in **NOAP- 47**.



- **Students in New Class Room**

Jubilant students are seen attending new and modern class rooms. Students expressed satisfaction in having nicely furnished rooms. (Photo: 13)



- **Shortage of Class Rooms:** All the Head Master/ Head Mistress who we talked to informed that although there are lot of space in the new 3 stored building but only top floor has been designed to be used for schooling purposes. There is provision of only 3 class rooms whereas the actual requirement is 6 nos. class rooms, as reported by them. The SMCs propose to set up more class

rooms on the first floor (Livestock floor) to meet their requirement. Without blocking the floor for livestock accommodation during cyclones, the school authorities may establish some classes on the floor with flexible partitions.

After field visit, we, along with the Field Resident Engineer, D&S Consultant, Noakhali and Assistant Engineer, LGED met the Project Manager, Toma Construction Ltd. to apprise him of our observations of the visit. We requested him to please rectify the defects as explained by us. The PM, Toma Construction Ltd assured us to make up the defects as early as possible.

F. Rehabilitation of Existing Shelter

LGED/MDSP/NOA/16-17/W-05

Major physical works for rehabilitation of shelters generally include the following:

- roof top screeding;
- lean concreting/ patent stone casting;
- patch brick work & construction/ re-construction of walls;
- outside and inside patch plastering;
- outside and inside painting,
- placement of tiles at staircase and on 1st/ 2nd floor;
- repair of staircase railing as necessary;
- supplying and fixing of ventilator grills and veranda grills;
- supply or repair of steel glazed window shutter with frames;
- supplying and fixing of M.S. door frame;
- supplying and fixing of wooden door shutters/ frames;
- repair/installation of M.S. Collapsible Gate;
- construction/ cleaning of septic tanks;
- repair of toilets with supply and fixing of tiles and modern sanitary features;
- installation of PVC water tank at roof;
- electrification works;
- back filling works where necessary, and
- supplying of school furniture for students and teachers, etc.

The M&E team visited 2 nos. of completed and handed over existing shelters at Suborno Char upazila of Noakhali district.

Physical Progress

- The NCB Contract Package covering 90 nos. existing school cum shelters in Noakhali district was awarded on 27 September 2018 and was targeted to be completed by 18 months i.e., 26 March 2020.
- The reported physical progress of the visited rehabilitation shelter are as follows:

NOAE- 252: 100% and NOAE- 276: 100%. These have already been handed over.

- Out of the 90 nos. shelters under the package, works of **88 nos.** shelters were taken up. Due to wrong selection of damaged buildings, two shelter sites have been omitted from the contract package. Completion date of the package has further been extended by 5 months up to 22 August 2020.
- As of end of May 2022, overall physical progress of the package covering 88 old shelters is **100%** against revised cumulative target as **100%**. All the 88 nos. of shelters have already been handed over to SMCs.

Status of the Rehabilitation Works in the Shelter

The rehabilitation works of the visited shelter site and its implementation status is given below:

- Roof Top Screeding – Done.

- Lean Concreting - Completed at ground floor (**Photo: 14**).



- Placement of tiles at staircase and on 1st floor- Done (**Photo: 15**).



- Outside & Inside Plastering Works as necessary: Done.
- Outside & Inside Painting Works: Completed (**Photo: 16**).



- Repair of toilets with supply and fixing of tiles and modern sanitary features: Done.
- Supplying and fixing of One Collapsible Gate: Done.
- Electrification Works: Completed
- School Furniture Supply: Done (**Photo: 17**)



G. Conclusion.

We would recommend to PMU, D&S consultants and related stakeholders to please consider our observations given above and take necessary measures as deemed appropriate.

Finally, we express our deep appreciation and thanks to the field personnel of LGED, the DS Consultants, SMC members, Teachers and the Contractors for their kind cooperation extended to us during the field visit.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman'.

A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman,
Team Leader, M&E Consultants,
MDSP, LGED